



Transactions on  
**Graph Data and Knowledge**

**Volume 1 | Issue 1 | December, 2023**

**Special Issue: Trends in Graph Data and Knowledge**

Edited by

Aidan Hogan  
Ian Horrocks  
Andreas Hotho  
Lalana Kagal



## TGDK Special Issue Editors

### Aidan Hogan

DCC, Universidad de Chile, IMFD, Chile  
ahogan@dcc.uchile.cl

### Ian Horrocks

University of Oxford, U.K.  
ian.horrocks@cs.ox.ac.uk

### Andreas Hotho

Department of Informatics, University of Würzburg,  
Germany  
hotho@informatik.uni-wuerzburg.de

### Lalana Kagal

Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Cambridge,  
MA, USA  
lkagal@csail.mit.edu

### ACM Classification 2012

Computing methodologies → Knowledge representation and reasoning; Information systems → Semantic web description languages; Information systems → Graph-based database models; Computing methodologies → Machine learning; Theory of computation → Graph algorithms analysis; Mathematics of computing → Graph theory

### Published online and open access by

Schloss Dagstuhl – Leibniz-Zentrum für Informatik GmbH, Dagstuhl Publishing, Saarbrücken/Wadern, Germany.

### Publication date

December, 2023

### Bibliographic information published by the Deutsche Nationalbibliothek

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available in the Internet at <https://dnb.d-nb.de>.

### License

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International license (CC BY 4.0): <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0>.



In brief, this license authorizes each and everybody to share (to copy, distribute and transmit) the work under the following conditions, without impairing or restricting the authors' moral rights:

- Attribution: The work must be attributed to its authors.

The copyright is retained by the corresponding authors.

### Digital Object Identifier

10.4230/TGDK.1.1.0

### Aims and Scope

Transactions on Graph Data and Knowledge (TGDK) is an Open Access journal that publishes original research articles and survey articles on graph-based abstractions for data and knowledge, and the techniques that such abstractions enable with respect to integration, querying, reasoning and learning. The scope of the journal thus intersects with areas such as Graph Algorithms, Graph Databases, Graph Representation Learning, Knowledge Graphs, Knowledge Representation, Linked Data and the Semantic Web. Also in-scope for the journal is research investigating graph-based abstractions of data and knowledge in the context of Data Integration, Data Science, Information Extraction, Information Retrieval, Machine Learning, Natural Language Processing, and the Web.

The journal is Open Access without fees for readers or for authors (also known as Diamond Open Access).

### Editors in Chief

- Aidan Hogan
- Ian Horrocks
- Andreas Hotho
- Lalana Kagal

### Editorial Office

Schloss Dagstuhl – Leibniz-Zentrum für Informatik  
TGDK, Editorial Office  
Oktavie-Allee, 66687 Wadern, Germany  
[tgdk@dagstuhl.de](mailto:tgdk@dagstuhl.de)

<https://www.dagstuhl.de/tgdk>



# ■ Contents

## Preface

Transactions on Graph Data and Knowledge

*Aidan Hogan, Ian Horrocks, Andreas Hotho, and Lalana Kagal* ..... 1:1–1:4

## Trends in Graph Data and Knowledge

Large Language Models and Knowledge Graphs: Opportunities and Challenges

*Jeff Z. Pan, Simon Razniewski, Jan-Christoph Kalo, Sneha Singhanía, Jiaoyan Chen, Stefan Dietze, Hajira Jabeen, Janna Omelíyanenko, Wen Zhang, Matteo Lissandrini, Russa Biswas, Gerard de Melo, Angela Bonifati, Edlira Vakaj, Mauro Dragoni, and Damien Graux* ..... 2:1–2:38

Knowledge Engineering Using Large Language Models

*Bradley P. Allen, Lise Stork, and Paul Groth* ..... 3:1–3:19

Knowledge Graph Embeddings: Open Challenges and Opportunities

*Russa Biswas, Lucie-Aimée Kaffee, Michael Cochez, Stefania Dumbrava, Theis E. Jendal, Matteo Lissandrini, Vanessa Lopez, Eneldo Loza Mencía, Heiko Paulheim, Harald Sack, Edlira Kalemí Vakaj, and Gerard de Melo* ..... 4:1–4:32

Knowledge Graphs for the Life Sciences: Recent Developments, Challenges and Opportunities

*Jiaoyan Chen, Hang Dong, Janna Hastings, Ernesto Jiménez-Ruiz, Vanessa López, Pierre Monnin, Catia Pesquita, Petr Škoda, and Valentina Tamma* ..... 5:1–5:33

Towards Ordinal Data Science

*Gerd Stumme, Dominik Dürrschnabel, and Tom Hanika* ..... 6:1–6:39

Rule Learning over Knowledge Graphs: A Review

*Hong Wu, Zhe Wang, Kewen Wang, Pouya Ghiasnezhad Omran, and Jiangmeng Li* ... 7:1–7:23

Machine Learning and Knowledge Graphs: Existing Gaps and Future Research Challenges

*Claudia d’Amato, Louis Mahon, Pierre Monnin, and Giorgos Stamou* ..... 8:1–8:35

Trust, Accountability, and Autonomy in Knowledge Graph-Based AI for Self-Determination

*Luis-Daniel Ibáñez, John Domingue, Sabrina Kirrane, Oshani Seneviratne, Aisling Third, and Maria-Esther Vidal* ..... 9:1–9:32

Multilingual Knowledge Graphs and Low-Resource Languages: A Review

*Lucie-Aimée Kaffee, Russa Biswas, C. Maria Keet, Edlira Kalemí Vakaj, and Gerard de Melo* ..... 10:1–10:19


How Does Knowledge Evolve in Open Knowledge Graphs?

*Axel Polleres, Romana Pernisch, Angela Bonifati, Daniele Dell’Aglío, Daniil Dobriy, Stefania Dumbrava, Lorena Etcheverry, Nicolas Ferranti, Katja Hose, Ernesto Jiménez-Ruiz, Matteo Lissandrini, Ansgar Scherp, Riccardo Tommasini, and Johannes Wachs* ..... 11:1–11:59

*Transactions on Graph Data and Knowledge*, Vol. 1, Issue 1, Article No. 0, pp. 0:v–0:x

Special Issue: Trends in Graph Data and Knowledge.

Editors: Aidan Hogan, Ian Horrocks, Andreas Hotho, and Lalana Kagal


 Transactions on Graph Data and Knowledge


TGDK Schloss Dagstuhl – Leibniz-Zentrum für Informatik, Dagstuhl Publishing, Germany


**0:vi Contents**


Structural Summarization of Semantic Graphs Using Quotients <i>Ansgar Scherp, David Richerby, Till Blume, Michael Cochez, and Jannik Rau</i> .....	12:1–12:25
Autonomy in the Age of Knowledge Graphs: Vision and Challenges <i>Jean-Paul Calbimonte, Andrei Ciortea, Timotheus Kampik, Simon Mayer, Terry R. Payne, Valentina Tamma, and Antoine Zimmermann</i> .....	13:1–13:22


## ■ List of Authors


Bradley P. Allen  (3)  
University of Amsterdam, Amsterdam, The Netherlands


Russa Biswas  (2, 4, 10)  
Hasso-Plattner Institute, Potsdam, Germany

Till Blume  (12)  
Ernst and Young Research, Berlin, Germany

Angela Bonifati  (2, 11)  
Lyon 1 University, CNRS, IUF, France


Jean-Paul Calbimonte  (13)  
University of Applied Sciences and Arts Western Switzerland HES-SO, Sierre, Switzerland

Jiaoyan Chen  (2, 5)  
The University of Manchester, United Kingdom;  
University of Oxford, United Kingdom


Andrei Ciortea  (13)  
Institute of Computer Science, University of St.Gallen, Switzerland


Michael Cochez  (4, 12)  
Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam, The Netherlands;  
Elsevier Discovery Lab, Netherlands


Claudia d'Amato  (8)  
University of Bari, Italy


Gerard de Melo  (2, 4, 10)  
Hasso-Plattner Institute, Potsdam, Germany

Daniele Dell'Aglio  (11)  
Aalborg University, Denmark


Stefan Dietze  (2)  
GESIS - Leibniz Institute for the Social Sciences,  
Cologne, Germany; Heinrich-Heine-Universität  
Düsseldorf, Germany


Daniil Dobriy  (11)  
Vienna University of Economics and Business,  
Austria

John Domingue  (9)  
Knowledge Media Institute, The Open University,  
Milton Keynes, UK


Hang Dong  (5)  
Department of Computer Science, University of  
Oxford, UK


Mauro Dragoni  (2)  
Fondazione Bruno Kessler, Trento, Italy


Stefania Dumbrava  (4, 11)  
ENSIIE, France


Dominik Dürschnabel  (6)  
Knowledge & Data Engineering Group, Research  
Center for Information System Design &,  
Department of Electrical Engineering and  
Computer Science, University of Kassel, Germany


Lorena Etcheverry  (11)  
Universidad de la República, Uruguay

Nicolas Ferranti  (11)  
Vienna University of Economics and Business,  
Austria


Damien Graux  (2)  
Edinburgh Research Centre, CSI, Huawei  
Technologies UK, United Kingdom


Paul Groth  (3)  
University of Amsterdam, Amsterdam, The  
Netherlands


Tom Hanika  (6)  
Institute of Computer Science, University of  
Hildesheim, Germany; Berlin School of Library and  
Information Science, Humboldt-Universität zu  
Berlin, Germany


Janna Hastings  (5)  
Institute for Implementation Science in Health  
Care, University of Zurich, Switzerland; School of  
Medicine, University of St. Gallen, Switzerland


Aidan Hogan  (1)  
DCC, Universidad de Chile, IMFD, Chile

Ian Horrocks  (1)  
University of Oxford, U.K

Katja Hose  (11)  
TU Wien, Austria

Andreas Hotho  (1)  
Department of Informatics, University of  
Würzburg, Germany

Luis-Daniel Ibáñez  (9)  
Department of Electronics and Computer Science,  
University of Southampton, UK

Hajira Jabeen  (2)  
GESIS - Leibniz Institute for the Social Sciences,  
Cologne, Germany

Theis E. Jendal  (4)  
Aalborg University, Denmark

*Transactions on Graph Data and Knowledge*, Vol. 1, Issue 1, Article No. 0, pp. 0:vii–0:x  
Special Issue: Trends in Graph Data and Knowledge.

Editors: Aidan Hogan, Ian Horrocks, Andreas Hotho, and Lalana Kagal

Transactions on Graph Data and Knowledge





TGDK Schloss Dagstuhl – Leibniz-Zentrum für Informatik, Dagstuhl Publishing, Germany


## 0:viii Authors


- Ernesto Jiménez-Ruiz  (5, 11)  
City, University of London, UK; SIRIUS,  
University of Oslo, Norway
- Lucie-Aimée Kaffee  (4, 10)  
Hasso-Plattner-Institut, Potsdam, Germany
- Lalana Kagal  (1)  
Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Cambridge,  
MA, USA
- Jan-Christoph Kalo  (2)  
University of Amsterdam, The Netherlands
- Timotheus Kampik  (13)  
Department of Computing Science, Umeå  
University, Sweden; SAP Signavio, Berlin, Germany
- C. Maria Keet  (10)  
University of Cape Town, South Africa
- Sabrina Kirrane  (9)  
Institute for Information Systems & New Media,  
Vienna University of Economics and Business,  
Austria
- Jiangmeng Li  (7)  
Institute of Software, Chinese Academy of Sciences,  
China
- Matteo Lissandrini  (2, 4, 11)  
Aalborg University, Denmark
- Vanessa Lopez  (4)  
IBM Research Dublin, Ireland
- Vanessa López  (5)  
IBM Research Europe, Dublin, Ireland
- Louis Mahon  (8)  
Oxford University, United Kingdom
- Simon Mayer  (13)  
Institute of Computer Science, University of  
St.Gallen, Switzerland
- Eneldo Loza Mencía  (4)  
research.eneldo.net, Frankfurt, Germany
- Pierre Monnin  (5, 8)  
Université Côte d'Azur, Inria, CNRS, I3S, France
- Janna Omelinyanenko  (2)  
University of Würzburg, Germany
- Pouya Ghiasnezhad Omran  (7)  
School of Computing, The Australian National  
University, Australia
- Jeff Z. Pan  (2)  
The University of Edinburgh, United Kingdom
- Heiko Paulheim  (4)  
Universität Mannheim, Germany
- Terry R. Payne  (13)  
Department of Computer Science, University of  
Liverpool, United Kingdom
- Romana Pernisch  (11)  
Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam, The Netherlands;  
Discovery Lab, Elsevier, Amsterdam, The  
Netherlands
- Catia Pesquita  (5)  
LASIGE, Faculdade de Ciências, Universidade de  
Lisboa, Portugal
- Axel Polleres  (11)  
Vienna University of Economics and Business,  
Austria; Complexity Science Hub Vienna, Austria
- Jannik Rau  (12)  
Ulm University, Germany
- Simon Razniewski  (2)  
Bosch Center for AI, Renningen, Germany
- David Richerby  (12)  
University of Essex, UK
- Harald Sack  (4)  
FIZ Karlsruhe, Germany; Karlsruhe Institute of  
Technology, AIFB, Germany
- Ansgar Scherp  (11, 12)  
Ulm University, Germany
- Oshani Seneviratne  (9)  
Department of Computer Science, Rensselaer  
Polytechnic Institute, USA
- Sneha Singhania  (2)  
Max Planck Institute for Informatics, Saarbrücken,  
Germany
- Giorgos Stamou  (8)  
National Technical University of Athens, Greece
- Lise Stork  (3)  
Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam, Amsterdam, The  
Netherlands
- Gerd Stumme  (6)  
Knowledge & Data Engineering Group, Research  
Center for Information System Design &,  
Department of Electrical Engineering and  
Computer Science, University of Kassel, Germany
- Valentina Tamma  (5, 13)  
Department of Computer Science, University of  
Liverpool, UK





Aisling Third  (9)  
Knowledge Media Institute, The Open University,  
Milton Keynes, UK


Riccardo Tommasini  (11)  
INSA Lyon, CNRS LIRIS, France


Edlira Vakaj  (2)  
Birmingham City University, United Kingdom


Edlira Kalemi Vakaj  (4, 10)  
Birmingham City University, UK

Maria-Esther Vidal  (9)  
Leibniz University of Hannover, Germany;  
TIB-Leibniz Information Centre of Science and  
Technology, Hannover, Germany; L3S Research  
Centre, Hannover, Germany


Johannes Wachs  (11)  
Corvinus University of Budapest, Hungary; Centre  
for Economic and Regional Studies, Hungary;  
Complexity Science Hub Vienna, Austria


Kewen Wang  (7)  
School of Information and Communication  
Technology, Griffith University, Australia

Zhe Wang  (7)  
School of Information and Communication  
Technology, Griffith University, Australia

Hong Wu  (7)  
School of Information and Communication  
Technology, Griffith University, Australia

Wen Zhang  (2)  
Zhejiang University, China

Antoine Zimmermann  (13)  
Mines Saint-Etienne, Université Clermont  
Auvergne, INP Clermont Auvergne, CNRS, UMR  
6158 LIMOS, France

Petr Škoda  (5)  
Department of Software Engineering, Faculty of  
Mathematics and Physics, Charles University,  
Prague, Czechia

